CITY OF SANTA CLARA



HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION MEETING

May 3, 2007 - Thursday
City Manager's Staff Conference Room
MINUTES
7:00 P.M.

ITEMS FOR COUNCIL ACTION

Agenda Item IX. C. Recommendation for Approval of a Mills Act Contract for 1291 Benton Street (PLN2006-05536).

Agenda Item IX.D. Recommendation for Approval of a Mills Act Contract for 1490 Santa Clara Street (PLN2007-06358).

Agenda Item IX.E. Recommendation for Approval of a Mills Act Contract for 1480 Santa Clara Street (PLN2007-06358).

- Call to Order
 Chairperson Richards called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.
- II. Roll Call

Commissioners: Marinshaw, McKee, Patton, Petersen and Richards

Commissioner Wilson was excused.

Commissioner Boynton arrived at 7:03 p.m. (after the approval of the Minutes of April 5, 2007).

Architectural Advisor Craig Mineweaser was not able to attend, but sent written comments regarding the two architectural items.

Staff Present: Judith Silva, Associate Planner/HLC Staff Liaison and Erwin Ordonez, Senior Housing Planner.

Guest Present: Lorie Kentzell, Michael Hyams, Barbara Mordy, Dixie Baus, Antony Ho, David Neale, Barry DelBrono, Teresa Nemeth, Sal Caruso, Rob Mayer, Lisa Taggart, Jim Gothers, Marisa Mayer, Don Arnoldy and Janean Snyder.

III. Requests for withdrawals and continuances without a hearing None

IV. Approval of Minutes

A. HLC Meeting Minutes of April 5, 2007

It was moved by Commissioner Marinshaw, seconded by Commissioner McKee and unanimously carried (Commissioners Wilson and Boynton excused) by those present to approve the minutes as written.

Note: Commissioner Boynton arrived at 7:03 p.m.

V. Items on this Agenda Requiring Council Action

The following items may be heard by the City Council upon a recommendation by the Historical and Landmarks Commission:

Agenda Items IX.C., IX.D. and IX.E.

VI. Council and Planning Commission Actions Pertaining to the Historical and Landmarks Commission (Discussion as Needed)

Ms. Silva briefly reviewed items of interest for the Commission from Planning Commission and City Council meetings.

VII. Correspondence/Announcements

A. General Correspondence Distributed in Commission Packet None

VIII. Public Presentations

There were none.

IX. New Business

A. Request for Demolition of 1828 Main Street and 1111-1123 Warburton Avenue (Martin's Bar, etc.) [northwest corner of Warburton Avenue and Main Street] for the Construction of 28 Affordable Senior Independent Housing Units

Commissioner McKee stated he resides in the nearby neighborhood and excused himself from discussion. Copies received from Volunteer Architectural Advisor, Craig Mineweaser, AIA were distributed to the Commission and applicant.

Ms. Silva introduced Project Planner/Senior Housing Planner to those present. Mr. Ordonez reviewed the request for the demolition of the existing commercial building and adjoining residences, while reviewing previous neighborhood concerns, neighborhood outreach to solicit input and comments and the current design. He noted the new structure, as proposed, would contain 28 units and will

be restricted to households that are 62 and older, which also includes a 2-bedroom unit for the resident manager. Mr. Ordonez then reviewed the project layout and design, noting the Commission was requested to make the following three recommendations: 1) demolition of five structures; 2) compatibility of new structure to the surrounding area; and 3) sidewalk pattern (separated vs. monolithic).

Commissioners Boynton and Petersen stated they liked the project. Commissioners Patton and Petersen stated they would like to see a tile roof on the structure which was more in keeping with the Portuguese theme, Belovida.

Barbara Mordy stated she resides in the neighborhood and supported the request. She noted the existing buildings were a blight on the neighborhood and that the other neighbors were also supporting this request.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Petersen, seconded by Commissioner Boynton and unanimously carried (Commissioner McKee abstaining, Commissioner Wilson was excused) to **recommend approval for the demolition** of the five existing structures.

It was then moved by Commissioner Petersen, seconded by Commissioner Marinshaw and carried (Commissioner McKee abstaining, Commissioner Wilson was excused and Commissioner Richards dissenting) to **recommend approval** of the architectural design, with a preference for tile roofing and the two conditions in the staff report relating to production information and elevation details.

Chairperson Richards stated he did not support the project as it was too large.

Ms. Mordy stated the neighborhood was requesting trees to soften and screen the structure for privacy reasons. Ella May Zeman also stated she wanted trees in the parkways.

It was then moved by Commissioner Marinshaw, seconded by Commissioner Boynton and unanimously carried (McKee abstaining and Wilson excused) to recommend approval of a separated sidewalk with trees and/or landscaping which is in keeping with the character of the Old Quad.

Ms. Silva advised those present that this item would be reviewed by the Planning Commission on May 23, 2007.

B. Request for Demolition of Current Office Building at 1460 Monroe Street (southwest corner of Monroe Street and El Camino Real) and Construction of a 4-Story Mixed Use Building with Ground Floor Retail and 3-stories of Residential Above (PLN2006-05960).

Ms. Silva reviewed the request for the demolition of the existing structure and the construction of a 4-story mixed use building. Upon further reviewing the request she noted staff was supporting the proposal as it was found to be compatible with the City's El Camino Design Guidelines and Secretary of the Interior's Standards for infill development in terms of massing, scale and relationship to the surrounding commercial and residential properties, subject to conditions.

Sal Caruso, architect and applicant for the proposal then addressed the Commission. He reviewed the architectural details of the site, noting the project incorporates neotraditional design, including Victorian and Craftsman details, with a mixture of exterior building materials to provide differentiation of commercial and residential use, visual texture, etc. to offset the massing of the linear form.

Copies of Volunteer Architectural Advisor, Craig Mineweaser AIA were distributed to the Commission and applicant. Mr. Mineweaser's recommendations included support of the request, with the rear façade of the proposed building be broken up, or articulated to reduce the apparent mass, a row of large trees to be planted along the rear fence line and that any historic materials from the former residence/office building be salvaged.

Commissioner Petersen stated he was not in favor of the architectural style.

There were two motions by Commissioner Boynton and Marinshaw to approve the request that failed due to a lack of a second.

The Commission then forwarded this request to the Planning Commission with no recommendation. Ms. Silva advised those present that this item would be reviewed by the Planning Commission on May 23, 2007.

C. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1291 Benton Street (PLN2006-05536) (Note: Continued from November 2006 HLC Meeting)

Ms. Silva noted this item had been continued in order for the property owner to obtain bids for restoration. She then noted the applicant's 10-year plan was attached as well as cost estimates for the removal of the asbestos siding.

Commissioner Patton thanked the applicant for complying with the Commission's request to obtain cost estimates for the removal of the asbestos shingles.

Chairperson Richards then asked if other property owners had been required to remove siding as a condition of a Mills Act Contract. Ms. Silva answer affirmatively that there was one on the 1700 block of Benton Street. The Chair stated he did not feel the cement decorations belonged on a historic property.

The property owner Janean Snyder was present. She stated that she and her husband had decided they also would like to remove the shingles and spoke about a former addition that had covered a window at the rear of the structure.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Boynton, seconded by Commissioner Patton and carried (Commissioner Wilson excused, Chairperson Richards dissenting) that the Historical and Landmarks Commission recommend City Council approval of a Mills Act Contract for the property at 1291 Benton Street.

Ms. Silva noted that this was a recommendation that would be heard by City Council.

The Commission then recessed for a 5-minute break.

D. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1490 Santa Clara Street (PLN2007-06357)

Ms. Silva noted the property was a qualified structure which is listed on the local register of architecturally/historically significant places and noted a 10-year plan for restoration efforts was proposed.

The property owner, Rob Mayer then addressed the Commission. He stated he was an architect and noted the property was formerly subdivided and that at a future time would like to move the house forward in alignment with the other surrounding properties. In response to questions from the Commission, Ms. Silva noted that any major changes on a Mills Act property would need to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and would receive review of the Historical and Landmarks Commission.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner McKee, seconded by Commissioner Marinshaw and unanimously carried (Commissioner Wilson excused) that the Historical and Landmarks Commission recommend City Council approval of a Mills Act Contract for the property at 1490 Santa Clara Street.

E. Request for Mills Act Contract – 1480 Santa Clara Street (PLN2007-06358)

Ms. Silva reviewed the request for a Mills Act Contract for this property. She noted the property was listed on the local register of architecturally/historically significant properties and that no significant additions or changes had been made to the structure.

The property owners were present for discussion.

Motion: It was moved by Commissioner Boynton, seconded by Commissioner McKee and unanimously carried (Commissioner Wilson excused) that the Historical and Landmarks Commission recommend City Council approval of a Mills Act Contract for the property at 1480 Santa Clara Street.

X. Old Business, Referrals and Continued Items

 A. Mills Act Criteria – Exterior and Interior Changes, Additions, Inspections and other

In response to a question from Chair Richards, the Commission concurred that detached accessory structure should not be included in the 25 percent maximum additions ruling.

XI. Commissioner/Committee Reports

A. Santa Clara Arts and Historic Consortium (McKee)
[Fourth Monday of each month at 7:15 p.m. - Headen-Inman House]

Commissioner McKee stated he had not been able to attend the meeting.

- B. Historic Preservation Society of Santa Clara (Richards/Marinshaw alternate) [Second <u>Friday</u> of each month at <u>10:00</u> a.m.- Harris Lass Preserve] Chair Richards reminded those present that the Garden Tour would be held on May 10th and the Father's Day Bicycle Tour.
- C. Old Quad Residents Association (Richards/McKee alternate)
 There was no meeting or report.
- D. Neighborhood University Relations (Petersen)
 There was no meeting or report.
- E. Architectural Committee (Marinshaw/Patton)

 There was no report or any architectural items related to the Commission.
- F. Agnews Historic Cemetery Museum Committee (Wilson and Patton) Commissioner Patton noted there was nothing new to report.
- G. BART Committee (Marinshaw)
 Commissioner Marinshaw noted there had not been a meeting.
- XII. Items Considered, Time Permitting
- XIII. A. Commission Budget for 2006-07

There was no discussion of this item.

- XIV. Pending Agenda Items (notice of upcoming agenda items only- No discussion)
 A. Commemorative plaque for the Verein (this item has been forwarded to Santa Clara University). Joe Sugg/SCU to install plaque when construction is completed, est. date Fall 2007).
 - B. Commissioner Training
 - C. Further updates on Harris-Lass Preserve
 - D. BART Station Design Workshop Notice
- XV. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 9:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted: Approved:

Judith Silva Associate Planner/HLC Staff Liaison Gloria Sciara, AICP
Interim Manager of Development Review/
Historic Resources Coordinator

I:\PLANNING\2007\HLC 2007\0503\min hlc 050307.rtf